

**MEETING MINUTES SUMMARY
GOVERNOR'S MILITARY AFFAIRS COMMISSION
THURSDAY, MAY 13, 2004, 10 A.M. TO 3 P.M.
YUMA COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS – MAIN AUDITORIUM**

OPENING REMARKS

Co-Chair Lisa Atkins opened the meeting and welcomed the commission members and guests to this first meeting of the Governor's Military Affairs Commission. She explained the mission of the commission and the process that the commission would follow. Created by executive order 2004-04 on March 2, 2004, the commission is comprised of fifteen (15) voting members where the thirteen (13) are appointed by the Governor and two by the leadership of the State Legislature. The mission of the commission is to monitor and make recommendations on executive, legislative and federal actions necessary to sustain and grow Arizona's network of military installations, training and testing ranges and associated airspace.

ROLL CALL & INTRODUCTIONS

Commission members were given an opportunity to introduce themselves individually. The remaining commission members include: James Cavanaugh, Mayor of the City of Goodyear; Tom Hessler, Mayor of the City of Sierra Vista; Sandie Smith, County Supervisor of Pinal County; Lenore Stuart, County Supervisor of Yuma County; Robert Walkup, Mayor of the City of Tucson; Michael Francis, President of the West Valley Community Action Coalition; Tom Finnegan, President of the Fort Huachuca 50; Bob Johnston (Lieutenant General, USMC, Ret.) of Tucson, Monsignor Richard O'Keeffe of Yuma; and Priscilla Storm of Tucson. Gene Santarelli (Lieutenant General, USAF, Ret.) and Tom Browning (Brigadier General, USAF, Ret.) were absent.

For the ex-officio members, representatives from the State Land Department, the Attorney General's office, and Department of Commerce were in attendance.

Co-Chair Lisa Atkins also recognized elected officials in the audience: Mayor Larry Nelson from the City of Yuma and Lucy Shipp from the Yuma County Board of Supervisors and a representative from Representative Grijalva's office.

OPEN MEETING LAW AND ETHICS BRIEFING – JOY HERNBRODE, ATTORNEY GENERAL'S OFFICE

Joy Hernbrode from the Attorney General's Office briefed the taskforce on the importance of adhering to the spirit of the open meeting law when conducting commission meetings. She explained that because the commission was created by executive order to advise the Governor, it was officially not subject to open meeting laws. So, she tailored her briefing to fact that since the commission was doing the public business that their business needed to be conducted in the public's view. Additional highlights of her guidance included 1) a quorum is need to take action which equates to a simple majority or at least eight commission members, 2) commission meeting agendas must be published at least 24 hours in advance 3) only items on the agenda can

be discussed 4) executive sessions can be closed but should be used for specific matters only 5) minutes must be taken on both open meetings and executive sessions; but these minutes will be kept separate 6) action can only be taken on items on the agenda; any actions taken on items not on the agenda are in violation of open meeting laws and will be considered null and void 7) only commission members can vote; designees can not vote in the absence of a commission member and 8) teleconferencing can be used to conduct meetings.

REVIEW OF THE DUTIES OF THE COMMISSION - GENE SANTARELLI

In Mr. Santarelli's absence, Co-Chair Lisa Atkins reviewed the duties of the commission as defined in executive order 2004-04. These duties are defined as follows:

- Advise the Governor on matters affecting the operational viability of military facilities within Arizona.
- Actively support implementation of taskforce recommendations.
- Meet regularly with the Governor to give advice on military issues and report progress on implementation.
- Serve as a resource for communications with the legislature, federal delegation, media and the community
- Develop criteria, including accountability, for awarding funds from the Military Installation Fund
- Annually recommend a priority listing of applications with available resources
- Establish a statewide network at the local level.

Throughout this process, Ms. Atkins encouraged a continuing dialogue between the commission members and their respective communities. The active participation of commission members in this effort is critical to the success of this commission and the long-term preservation of our military facilities. Finally, she closed by emphasizing that the commission must develop recommendations that address the actions required to preserve Arizona's installations, address issues from a statewide perspective and are relevant to the emerging "transformation" of the U.S. Department of Defense.

(See special note below to request a copy of presentation slides)

REPORTS & DISCUSSION:

TASKFORCE REVIEW - BOB JOHNSTON

Commissioner Bob Johnston, former co-chair of the Governor's Military Facilities Task Force, provided a review of the work of the taskforce. Created by executive order 2003-18 on May 27, the taskforce was comprised of nine voting member and one advisory member. The remaining taskforce members included: Co-Chair Tom Browning (Brigadier General, USAF, Ret.) of Phoenix, Tom Finnegan of Sierra Vista representing Fort Huachuca, Monsignor Richard Richard O'Keeffe of Yuma representing the Marine Corps Air Station and the Army Yuma Proving Grounds, Steve Thu of Tucson representing the Arizona National Guard & Reserve units, Lisa Atkins of the West Valley representing Luke Air Force Base, Lori Faeth, the Governor's Natural Resource Policy Advisor, Gil Jimenez of the Arizona Department of Commerce, Gene Santarelli of Tucson representing Davis-Monthan. The taskforce advisor was Patricia Boland from the

Attorney General's office. The mission of the taskforce was to develop strategies for ensuring the long-term retention of all military facilities in Arizona, so that they may continue to perform their vital National mission. After seven months of work and public meetings, the taskforce delivered its report with 27 recommendations to the Governor on December 5, 2003.

He continued his report by stepping through individual operational overviews for each of Arizona's major military facilities. These facilities included the Marine Corps Air Station Yuma, US Army Yuma Proving Ground, Fort Huachuca, Davis Monthan Air Force Base, and Luke Air Force Base. Other units and operations that were mentioned included the Arizona Air National Guard, the Arizona Army National Guard at Florence Training Range and Silverbell Heliport at Marana. He also covered the following training ranges: Barry M. Goldwater Range, Chocolate Mountain Range and Kofa Range and the military operating areas: Sells, Gladden/Bagdad, Outlaw/Jackal and Sunny/Tombstone.

To give a broader perspective to the taskforce's activities, Mr. Johnston provided some insight into the Department of Defense (DoD) Quadrennial Defense Review Report published in September 2001. This report is the first signal to the military on how the Secretary of Defense plans to re-shape the DoD. One of the important changes involves a shift in mindset with how the DoD prepares to fight conflicts. They are taking a smarter approach by moving from a threat-based focus (who we might fight i.e. the Soviets, Iraqi, etc) to a capabilities based focus (concerned with how they might fight us = urban assault training). Another shift in mindset crosses the lines of individual branches of military service where 'joint and combined operations are the name of the game with the planning for programs like the Joint National Training Center. Other highlights in this report focus on exploiting intelligence, expanding unmanned vehicle (UAV) programs, and utilization of research and development test centers and ranges. "Faster, Lighter, Smarter"

With this insight into the transformation of the DoD, Mr. Johnston explained how Arizona is poised to contribute to these changes in mindset. With the capabilities of Arizona's unique network of multi-service installations and access to several training ranges like the Barry M. Goldwater, these are advantages that Arizona has over other states in the US.

With all this information Mr. Johnston indicated the taskforce developed its recommendations around several common themes:

- 1) Preserve and grow AZ's network of military installations to satisfy the long term needs of the DOD and maximize the benefit to AZ's economy.
- 2) Maximize actions at the local level
- 3) Establish and sustain solid state and federal support
- 4) Recognize and leverage existing statutes, initiatives and effective efforts

Ten days after delivery of the taskforce report, the Governor gave full support for all 27 taskforce recommendations in the report. Governor's Military Facilities Taskforce Report and recommendations are available on the Governor's website at: www.governor.state.az.us. In conclusion, Mr. Johnston indicated that future military responses would demand the successful execution of highly complex joint military operations. He explained that Arizona must demonstrate that our assigned forces and our training centers and ranges contribute greatly to

strengthening joint operations. And, Arizona must enable joint transformation exercises and experiments and help develop and foster a joint professional culture. Thus, our message to the Department of Defense will be that in Arizona we can do all of that!
(See special note below to request a copy of presentation slides)

LEGISLATIVE UPDATE – LISA ATKINS

Co-Chair Lisa Atkins provided a brief review of military bases bills signed by the Governor during this legislative session so far.

- HB 2134: NATURAL GAS STORAGE FACILITIES - prohibits the location of large natural gas storage facilities near military installations
- HB 2141: MILITARY AIRPORT; RESTRICTED ZONES – includes Luke AFB Auxiliary Airfield #1 in its designations and maps of APZs, zones, high noise and accident potential zones, etc.
- HB 2662: MILITARY AIRPORTS; TRAINING ROUTES - defines “military training routes” (MTRs) and adds notification to landowners

For a complete copy of the bills, please go to the Arizona State Legislature website at <http://www.azleg.state.az.us/>.

REPORT FROM THE YUMA COMMUNITY MILITARY SUPPORT GROUP - MONSIGNOR RICHARD O’KEEFFE

Commissioner Monsignor Richard O’Keeffe provided a few remarks about the issues impacting the Yuma community and their military installations. They mentioned the lack of encroachment experienced by both of Yuma Marine Corps Air Station and the US Army Yuma Proving Ground in the Yuma community but that emphasized the need for improved commercial air service into the City of Yuma. He continued his report by introducing Mr. Ken Ken Rosevear, President of the Yuma County Chamber of Commerce who helps support the Yuma Community with its Military Affairs Committee and its activities.

Mr. Rosevear explained that the Yuma Community Military Support Group was comprised of twenty (20) members who meet monthly to discuss ways to support their local military installations and their service members. He also provided details about two recent activities that the group has been involved in:

- 1) Warrior Welcome Home Parade & Celebration where approximately 1,500 Warriors and 10,000 spectators and supporters participated. (Click on this link to see the promotional video for this event: <http://www.co.yuma.az.us/chnl77/index.htm>).
- 2) Armed Forces Park - The park is a Chamber owned development under the direction of our Military Affairs Committee. Yuma's Armed Forces Memorial Park is located at the site of the old railroad depot on Gila Street in downtown Yuma. Sales of memorial plaques have been taking place over the past two years to generate revenue to fund park construction and maintenance. The goal is the sale of 3,000 plaques with 1,900 left to go.

Lunch break started at 11:40am.

REMARKS BY GOVERNOR JANET NAPOLITANO

After the lunch break, the Governor of the State of Arizona, the Honorable Janet Napolitano thanked the Yuma community for hosting this first Military Affairs Commission meeting. She continued her remarks by expressing her appreciation for the importance of the contributions that Arizona's military bases have made and will continue to make to our nation's defense. Two prime examples are Yuma Marine Corp Air Station and the US Army Yuma Proving Ground here in this community. As a result, The Governor is continually proud to say that Arizona, with its network of military installations, testing and training facilities, ranges, and associated airspace, is uniquely positioned to satisfy most of the DOD's training needs for many years to come.

In addition to contributing to this country's national defense needs, Arizona's military installations are also a significant part of Arizona's economy. The military industry creates jobs and revenue not only for itself, but also for the businesses it supports.

Arizona's military industry generated over 83,000 jobs, and more than \$5.6 billion in output in the 2000 fiscal year. For the Yuma community this equates to \$859 million dollars in economic impact with 16,368 jobs. And these are the types of jobs that are present in good and bad economic times. Thus, preserving the military industry in Arizona is essential to the long-term fiscal health of the State. A healthy state economy provides a strong foundation on which to create a better life for the future generations of Arizonans, our children.

After receipt of the Military Facilities Task Force report in December 2003, the Governor accepted all 27 taskforce recommendations and developed her plan to protect the missions of Arizona's military installations. So when the General Legislative Session began, she proposed a legislative package (originally House Bill 2605, now House Bill 2140) that included changes to state statutes to protect missions of all of Arizona's military facilities and the creation of a Military Installation fund. Other components of the Governor's plan included

- 1) Directing Actions of State-Level Departments to Protect missions of AZ's Military Facilities (State Land, Commerce, Real Estate, and Emergency Management & Military Affairs through the Arizona National Guard)
- 2) Hiring a Fulltime Policy Advisor on Military Affairs (appointed December 1, 2003)
- 3) Creating Fulltime Presence in Washington D.C. (Office opened January 2004)
- 4) Creating Permanent Military Affairs Commission (Exec. Order 2004-04; first meeting scheduled for May 13, 2004)

At this point in her remarks, the Governor revealed that she would sign House Bill 2140 and thanked those attending the meeting who assisted with the work to develop it and help this bill pass through the State Legislature. House Bill 2140 contains needed changes to state statutes to protect missions of additional of Arizona's military facilities (i.e. Gila Bend Auxiliary Airfield and Yuma Auxiliary Airfield #2) and creates a Military Installation Fund with General Fund

appropriations for \$4.8M in FY05 and FY06 and every year thereafter. (For a complete copy of this bill, please go to the Arizona State Legislature website at <http://www.azleg.state.az.us/>.)

In closing the Governor emphasized that a sustained state-wide effort is essential to preventing the deterioration of our military bases' missions. So while our Arizona armed forces continue to conduct their important defense missions, local communities in cooperation with this commission also have a mission. National defense and the state's well being depend upon it.

(See special note below to request a copy of presentation slides.)

JOINT LAND USE EFFORTS AND OTHER MILITARY SUPPORT ACTIVITIES IN THE STATE – DEB SYDENHAM

Deb Sydenham from the Arizona Department of Commerce provided a briefing on the Arizona Regional Compatibility Project as a part of the Joint Land Use Study (JLUS) Projects in Arizona. She reviewed the history of JLUS in Arizona, its primary objective, positive by-products of the JLUS process, Arizona's land use compatibility laws and regulations, outcomes of the Davis-Monthan JLUS project recently completed and the future phases for JLUS projects in Arizona

Some other statewide base preservation efforts are listed below:

- JLUS Projects – DM completed Feb 2004 (future projects: Luke Aux #1; Gila Bend Aux. Airfield /BMGR; MCAS-Yuma 1996 Review)
- \$10M Bond Referendum by City of Tucson
- AZ National Guard & Pinal County Land Use Compatibility Workgroups
- Luke AFB \$27M Land Acquisition Project
- Formation of the BMGR Taskforce
- BLM Land Exchange Efforts
- Ft. Huachuca - Expansion of UAV Missions/C4ISR/USPP
- Yuma Training Range Complex renamed after Congressman Bob Stump

(See special note below to request a copy of presentation slides.)

DISCUSSION ABOUT THE COMMISSION'S ROLE WITH THE MILITARY INSTALLATION FUND - LISA ATKINS

Based on the House Bill 2140, co-Chair Lisa Atkins led a discussion on the role of the commission with the Military Installation Fund. The roles of the commission are listed as follows:

- Work with the Dept. of Commerce to develop rules procedures to review applications to the military installation fund (MIF)
- Arizona Department of Commerce will forward all applications to MIF to commission for review and recommendations on awards
- Make recommendations to Dept. of Commerce on the following:
 - o Each applicant that should be awarded monies from the fund–Dollar amount that each applicant should be awarded from the fund

BRIEFING ON RULES PROCEDURES – BILL HYLEN, GOVERNOR'S REGULATORY REVIEW COUNCIL

Bill Hylen from the Governor's Regulatory Review Council provided a brief presentation on rules procedures and the rule-making process. He reviewed the rulemaking procedure, covered some helpful hints and explained where to gain assistance with this process. The rule-making manual is available on the Secretary of State's Office website at: http://www.sos.state.az.us/public_services/rulemakingmanual/2001/manual.htm) and additional guidance is available on the Governor's Regulatory Review Council website at: <http://www.grrc.state.az.us/>. Mr. Hylen concluded his remarks by offering to provide a more in-depth review of the process during the class on rule-making process to anyone who was interested.

BRAC (Base Realignment and Closure) UPDATE – DION FLYNN, GOVERNOR'S OFFICE for GENE SANTARELLI

Dion Flynn, Policy Advisor on Military Affairs to the Governor and Director of the Commission provided a brief update on the BRAC process in Mr. Santarelli's absence. She started with highlights of the BRAC timeline from December 31, 2003 with the release of the draft base selection criteria to November 5, 2005 for the President's presentation of the BRAC closure list to Congress. In terms of the BRAC process based on feedback from a recent trip to the Pentagon, Ms. Flynn indicated that each service emphasized the "R" for realignment where the military value of each of our installations to the Department of Defense (DOD) and their capacity to accept new missions was key.

Thus, she continued by explaining that the primary consideration for the BRAC process was mission capability of each military installation to conduct its national defense mission. (What have the state, county and local governments done to protect the ability of the military to use its bases for meaningful training?). She also clarified that the "25% reduction" that Secretary Rumsfeld mentioned in the past relates to excess capacity in the DOD, not necessarily excess installations.

In relations to the data collection efforts, Ms. Flynn indicated that the service representatives stressed the need for "accurate data" during the BRAC process and explained how each service wanted to receive this data, respectively. In many cases, they explained that any data that would be used by the BRAC decision-makers would have to be certified through the leadership of our military installations, but these representatives would also be willing to receive data from us directly. Otherwise, the BRAC decision-makers are constrained to rely on the data received from the installations or what information can be gathered from national statistics. This relates to the remaining BRAC criteria.

Ms. Flynn continued her updates with a review of the Final Selection Criteria For 2005 BRAC. Here is a list of the criteria:

- Military Value:

- 1) Current & Future Mission Capabilities
- 2) Availability & Condition of Land, Facilities, and Associated Airspace including Training Areas
- 3) Ability to Accommodate Contingency, Mobilization, and Future Total Force Requirements

4) Cost of Operations & Manpower Implications

- Other Considerations

5) Extent & Timing of Potential Costs and Savings

6) Economic Impact on Existing Communities

7) Ability of Communities' Infrastructure to Support Forces, Missions and Personnel

8) Environmental Impact including costs related to environmental restoration, waste management, and compliance activities

In conclusion, Ms. Flynn emphasized that Arizona's military installations are very competitive in the BRAC process but they need their local communities and the commissioners to keep their eyes and ears open concerning any erroneous interpretations of data about Arizona's military installations coming out of this process. This is needed because erroneous interpretations of data can lead to wrong decisions about our installations.

(See special note below to request a copy of presentation slides.)

DEVELOPMENT OF SUBCOMMITTEE/STUDY GROUPS – LISA ATKINS

Co-chair Lisa Atkins led a discussion on the development of subcommittees/study groups for the commission. The following is a list of the subcommittees, brief explanation about them and which commissioners volunteered to participate on them:

- Subcommittees: –Legislative: will review and monitor current state and federal legislation and provide recommendations to the full commission for possible future actions (Volunteers:

Supervisor Stuart, Monsignor O'Keeffe, Bob Johnston)

- Rules Procedures: will work with the Department of Commerce to develop the rules procedures to review the applications to the military installation fund and make recommendations on how the funds should be spent (Volunteers: Michael Francis, Mayor Walkup, Supervisor Stuart, Mayor Hessler)

- Public Outreach: will develop the communications needed to develop relationships with the local communities impacted by military installations, federal delegation, media, and other military support groups (Volunteers: Monsignor O'Keeffe)

- Airspace & Military Training Routes (MTRs): report to the commission on issues impacting the airspace designated for military operations and MTRs (Volunteers: Supervisor Smith, Tom Finnegan, Tom Browning)

- Arizona National Guard & Reserves Issues: report to the commission in issues impacting the missions of National Guard & Reserve units to conduct their operations in AZ (Volunteers: Supervisor Smith)

In closing, Ms Atkins encouraged each commissioner to participate on at least one subcommittee, such that their schedules would allow them.

MISSION BRIEFING ABOUT YPG – COLONEL STEPHEN KREIDER, US ARMY YUMA PROVING GROUND

Colonel Stephen Kreider, Commander of the US Army Yuma Proving Ground (YPG) provided a mission briefing on YPG. YPG covers 838,000 acres in Yuma, AZ (roughly the size of Rhode Island) with 2,500 square miles of restricted airspace. There are approximately 127 active duty military personnel, 622 Department of Defense civilians and 948 contractor personnel on YPG.

It is the Army's center for desert environment testing and also manages the cold weather testing in Alaska and tropical testing in Hawaii. Yuma's Proving Ground has a climate and terrain similar to Middle Eastern countries, so it played a crucial role in America's preparation for the Afghanistan and Iraqi conflicts. Special Forces teams from all services conduct land navigation, tactical training, and parachute training here.

(See special note below to request a copy of presentation slides.)

FUTURE MEETING DATE (S) AND LOCATION (S):

The next meeting is scheduled August 24, 2004 in Sierra Vista. Future dates, times and locations will be announced at a later time.

DISCUSSION ABOUT FUTURE ACTION ITEMS

- 1) Mayor Walkup requested information about a possible pipeline running through the Barry M. Goldwater Range (BMGR).
- 2) Mayor Walkup was interested in finding out more about distribution of Homeland Security Monies in Arizona
- 3) Bob Johnston wanted to learn more about potential conflicts with Unmanned Aerial Vehicle border use of restricted airspace over the BMGR.
- 4) Mayor Hessler would like to continue discussions about a Arizona nomination for a BRAC commissioner.
- 5) Monsignor O'Keeffe would like further discussions about commercial airline service into smaller Arizona communities supporting military operations involving the Arizona Department of Transportation and the Federal Aviation Administration.
- 6) Mike Francis asked that a final determination be made on whether this commission falls under open meeting law since it is being referenced in statute through the signing of HB2140.

CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Co-Chair Lisa Atkins made a call to the public. There was no response from the public.

ADJOURNMENT

Since there was no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3pm.

NEXT MEETING:

The next Governor's Military Affairs Commission meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, August 24, starting at 10am in Sierra Vista, Arizona. Location to be announced

Special Note: Electronic copies of the presentations or any other materials noted above are available on request. Please contact Dion Flynn at (602) 542-7007 or send an email to dflynn@az.gov.

For additional information about the Governor's Military Affairs Commission, checkout our web page at <http://www.governor.state.az.us/mft/index.html>